http://elec3004.com

ELEC7312 Paper Review Instructions/Tips (As Slides)

ELEC 3004: **Digital Linear Systems**: Signals & Controls
Dr. Surya Singh

elec3004@itee.uq.edu.au
http://robotics.itee.uq.edu.au/~elec3004/

June 3, 2015

Paper Review Description

- **Task Description:** An extensive review and analysis of a recent (published after 2008), high-quality (A*) journal paper (e.g., an IEEE Transactions) related to Signals, Systems, or Digital Controls or its application must be presented. This review should be at least **2 pages long** and should be presented in IEEE Transactions Format (10-point, double-column) and should reflect on the novelty of the work.

- **Criteria & Marking:** UQ students: Please sign in to mySI-net to view your list of enrolled courses and click the relevant **Profile** link to access marking criteria held in this profile

- **Submission:**
  - Electronic: Emailed (as PDF) to elec3004@itee.uq.edu.au **or**
  - Paper: In folder outside Bldg. 78-Room 531 (Surya Singh's office)

- **Due Date:**
  - Friday, July 3, 2015 by 12:00 (**noon**) [**strict deadline**]

Format & Page Count

- The IEEE format is basically:
  - 2-Column
  - 10-point ***Times*** *or* ***Times New Roman*** font
  - Single line spacing
- A template is available from the IEEE for:
  - Word **or**
  - LaTeX: Document Template + Bibliography Template
- Page Count
  - It should be at least 2 pages long.

Oral Viva

- [optional]
- In addition, students may arrange to present their work to the course coordinator (Surya Singh) as an oral viva
- The purpose of this presentation is to show understanding of the chosen paper and, in particular, the **Signal, Systems and Controls** aspects within it.
- This needs to be scheduled (via email to elec3004@itee.uq.edu.au) in advance
- Viva (if optionally chosen) must be done by **July 3, 2015 at 12:00 (noon)**

Things to Consider

- Abstract (short is sweet!)
  - What is the Problem, gap, approach, key results?
- Introduction
  - What is the "scientific gap" (what technical aspects have not yet been solved)?
- Related Work
  - How does prior work relates to this?
- Approach
  - What is the approach?
  - What is the innovation?
- Results
  - What are key results?
  - Main questions that are being investigated in experiment(s)?
  - How is it tested? Data sets, simulator, implementation details
  - What is the validation? Simulation of known results? Empirically?
- Summary/Discussions/Conclusion
  - Is the problem discuss with respect to open questions?
  - What are some new promising research directions from this?
- **References**

On the Introduction/Related Work

Consider:

- Does this paper motivate its problem
  - Why does it matter?
  - Why is it not solved yet?
  - What impact would a solution have?
  - What contribution did you make?

On the Approach/Results

- It doesn't matter how paper got there…
  - "We tried A, it didn't work, therefore we tried B" ☹
  - "B works. To see, let us consider an obvious alternative A, and show A does not work" ☺
- Does it document progress, not just achievement
  - "B works" ☹
  - "B improves over A (current techniques) by X, which is important because of …" ☺

Reviewer Background Expertise

Reviewers may not be familiar with your area:

- Problem motivation
- State of the art
- Background material
- Notation
- Measures for evaluation
- Significant application domains